```
1
                    UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
                     SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
 2
                          HOUSTON DIVISION
 3
                                           1:18-CV-068
 4
    STATE OF TEXAS, ET AL
                                           Houston, Texas
 5
    VS.
                                           1:36 p.m.
 6
                                           October 8, 2019
    UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
                           MOTION HEARING
 8
 9
               BEFORE THE HONORABLE ANDREW S. HANEN
                    UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE
10
11 APPEARANCES:
12
   FOR THE STATE OF TEXAS:
13 Todd Lawrence Disher, Adam Arthur Briggs, Phillip Trent
   Peroyea
14 OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
   209 W. 14th St., 8th Floor
15 Austin, Texas 78701
   512.936.2266
16
17
18 FOR HOUSTON HISPANIC CHAMBER OF COMMERCE, ET AL:
   Nina Perales
19 MALDEF
   110 Broadway, Suite 300
20 San Antonio, Texas 78205
   210.224.5476
21
   And
22
   Ramon A. Soto
23 Mexican American Legal Defense & Educational Fund
   110 Broadway, Suite 300
24 San Antonio, Texas 78205
   210.224.5476
25
                Johnny C. Sanchez, RMR, CRR - jcscourtreporter@aol.com
```

```
1 Court Reporter:
   Johnny C. Sanchez, RPR, RMR, CRR
 2 515 Rusk, #8004
Houston, Texas 77002
3 713.250.5581
 4 Proceedings recorded by mechanical stenography. Transcript
   produced by computer-assisted transcription.
 5
 6
 7
 8
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
                  Johnny C. Sanchez, RMR, CRR - jcscourtreporter@aol.com
```

```
THE COURT: All right. Be seated.
 1
                    We're here in State of Texas, et al versus
 2
 3
    U.S.A., et al.
                    Mr. Disher, you're here for the State.
 4
 5
    Who else is there with you?
 6
                  MR. DISHER: Yes, Your Honor. Todd Disher
 7
    for the State, and with me I have Adam Biggs, and Trent
 8
    Peroyea.
 9
                  MR. BIGGS: Good afternoon, Your Honor.
10
                  MR. PEROYEA: Good afternoon, Your Honor.
11
                  THE COURT: Ms. Perales, you're here for the
12
    defendant intervenors. Who else is with you?
13
                  MS. PERALES: Good afternoon, Your Honor.
14
    In addition to me, Nina Perales, I have with me Mr. Ramon
15
    Soto.
16
                  THE COURT: All right. And who is
17
    representing the great State of New Jersey?
18
                  MR. MORAMARCO: I am, Your Honor, Glenn
19
    Maramarco.
20
                  THE COURT: And, Mr. Hu, little table over
21
    at the side.
22
                  MR. HU: Fine by me.
23
                  THE COURT: Let me start with what may be
24
    the easy one. I have a motion to compel. Is that
25
    resolved? Have we produced the documents? Do you have
               Johnny C. Sanchez, RMR, CRR - jcscourtreporter@aol.com
```

```
them?
 1
 2
                  MR. DISHER: Your Honor, last Tuesday, we
 3
    essentially -- well, a week before that, we had agreed to
 4
    produce all of the responsive documents that Alabama and
 5
    Arkansas had, and then the last Tuesday we did indeed
 6
    produce those documents. So I can report to the Court
 7
    that based on their search, there's nothing else
 8
    responsive to produce to those requests.
 9
                  THE COURT: Does that moot the motion, or do
10
    you think there's something else there?
11
                  MS. PERALES: No, Your Honor. I mean, we
12
    didn't receive what we asked for, but if the position of
13
    the plaintiffs is that there is nothing more to produce,
14
    then we're happy to withdraw the motion to compel.
15
                  THE COURT: All right. I'll just deny it as
    moot. You don't have to file anything. I'll deny it as
16
17
    moot.
18
                  MS. PERALES: Okay. Thank you.
19
                  THE COURT: Okay. So let's get to the real
20
    business at hand, which is the great State of New Jersey's
21
    motion to stay. Let me just talk for a minute. I mean,
22
    there's no magic to this. And, quite frankly, you know,
23
    if I could predict what the Supreme Court is going to do,
24
    I'd probably quit this job and go to Vegas and, you know,
25
    make some real money, but -- and I quess maybe I ought to
```

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

```
start with you, Mr. Moramarco, because it is your motion.
But what makes us think that the Supreme Court is going to
rule on anything that helps me? Let me be selfish for a
minute. What's going to help me?
              MR. MORAMARCO: Sure, Your Honor. Would you
prefer I go there?
              THE COURT: Why don't you come up here
because it's easier for the court reporter to hear. Not
this court reporter, any court reporter. His hearing is
fine.
              MR. MORAMARCO: Sure, Your Honor.
                Our position is that there is substantial
overlap between the issues that are before the Supreme
Court and the issues that are before this Court. If you
look at the way the case -- look at the way the case was
briefed before the Supreme Court, the United States has
raised two issues.
                Really, the first one is whether or not
the recision is judicially reviewable under the APA.
if the Court were to rule for the government there, this
case would essentially, presumably, might not be anything
left to decide here, because the recision -- if the
recision is valid, then whether or not the initial -- the
initial grant under DACA no longer is relevant. And
that's the reason that Texas came into this case.
```

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

```
But on the second question, the government
argues fairly strenuously that DACA is lawful and that
issue has been joined by all of the competing briefs as
well.
      The government spent five pages of its opening
brief on the argument that DACA is in fact lawful. I was
looking --
              THE COURT:
                         Really?
              MR. MORAMARCO: I'm sorry. That DACA's
recision is lawful.
              THE COURT: Okay. I was going to say.
              MR. MORAMARCO: That DHS correctly concluded
that DACA was unlawful. So I think that issue has
been joined by all the parties there, and that's one of
the -- that's certainly one of the issues that's been
          I know that Ted Olson in the brief that he
briefed.
filed, spent 11 pages on the argument that DACA is lawful.
                So the issue clearly is one that the Court
may reach, but even if it doesn't reach that directly
because there are other ways the Court could end up
deciding this issue, I do think it will give -- it will
give some assistance to this Court.
                I mean, I recall when a year ago, this
Court issued its preliminary injunction ruling, and it
certified potential questions the Fifth Circuit looking
for quidance on issues, and some of those issues are, in
```

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

```
fact, again briefed before the Supreme Court.
                From Page 52 of the government's brief
before the Supreme Court, they argue that there's no
meaningful distinction between the lawfulness of DACA and
the lawfulness of the original DACA policy. That was one
of the issues that you certified to the Court and said
that there was a reasonable difference of opinion on that.
                There's also the issue of whether or not
there is problematic discretion sufficient to make the
program valid, and you noted that "Regions and Vidal
Batalla" both found that, saying that reasonable minds
could differ on that.
                So those are some of the issues that are
percolating before the Supreme Court. Now, we don't know
for sure that it's going to reach all of those, but there
is a good chance for potential if the government wins that
case, and we'll know I guess in about 6 to 8 months.
              THE COURT: Is there anything that this
Court can do? I mean, obviously, I can rule. I mean, but
is there anything short of that, ruling on the merits,
that would, for lack of a better term, help tee up the
issue for the supremes to go ahead and decide it? I mean,
anybody given any thought to that?
              MR. MORAMARCO: Well, I think briefing would
have been done in the Supreme Court. So I'm not sure that
```

```
1
    they could react. I guess they could file a 28(j) sort of
 2
    letter to sort of inform the Court of what else has been
 3
    happening here. But the briefing in the Supreme Court
    will obviously be done. But I quess one of the
 4
 5
    questions --
                  THE COURT: Here's, I quess here's my --
 6
 7
    here's my worry -- and, Mr. Disher, I'll let you weigh in
 8
    because I know you're opposed to this -- but here's my
 9
    worry about if I was to grant your motion. The obvious
10
    worry is we wait eight months and nothing happens; or they
11
    rule, but they don't say anything that helps resolve this
12
    case. And what makes me worry about that is some of those
13
    courts -- and I can't remember which ones because they
14
    were four or five that ruled on the recision of DACA --
15
    some of them basically said: Well, no court has ever held
    it to be illegal. Which is technically true. But, I
16
17
    mean, so they dodge the issue. And, you know, I said:
                                                            In
18
    my order, on the legality part of it, based almost
19
    entirely on the Fifth Circuit opinion that I have to
20
    follow, said that given their opinion in DACA, it would
21
    probably be the same in DACA.
22
                    Now, I denied the injunction for a number
23
    of other reasons, but would I obviously love for the
24
    Supreme Court to take this now, the answer is yes.
25
                    All right. Mr. Disher, weigh in. You
```

```
1
    don't have to sit down. Just stay right there or feel
    more comfortable sit in that first chair.
 2
 3
                  MR. DISHER: Thank you, Your Honor.
                                                       So just
    a few points in response to some of your questions.
 4
 5
                    There is very much a scenario here in
 6
    which the Supreme Court rules on the 2017 recision cases
 7
    before it, and never once addresses the legality of the
 8
    underlying 2012 memo, which is the heart of this case, of
 9
    course.
10
                  THE COURT: Right. That's what the courts
11
    did of the opinion that they granted cert on.
12
                  MR. DISHER: Correct. And, so, I think
13
    that, to Your Honor's point, there is very much a
14
    possibility that if the stay is granted in this case,
15
    we're now eight, nine, 12 months from now, and we still
    don't have an opinion from the Supreme Court that really
16
17
    helps this Court. And all we have done at that point is a
18
    year and a half worth of litigation that has already
19
    occurred, discovery is closed, the motions are fully
20
    briefed, and we have an imminent setting on our motion for
21
    summary judgment that is fully teed up.
22
                    Now, we would just be kicking that can
23
    down the road, and there may not be anything to gain from
24
    doing so. And then also to your point of if there's
25
    anything else that this Court can do to help tee up the
```

10

11

```
issue before the Supreme Court -- now, I know that the
 2
    parties in that case hotly dispute the state of rationales
 3
    for the recision, but the government's position is that
    one of those reasons for pulling DACA down was because
 4
 5
    they were worried about future litigation over the
 6
    legality of the 2012 memo.
 7
                    That is very much what this case is about,
 8
    and the fact that this case now exists proves them right,
 9
    and if this case gets stayed in some way, I think that
    perhaps maybe diminishes their argument. And if this
    Court was to rule on the pending motion for summary
12
    judgment, whether one way or the other, I think that that
13
    would certainly go towards the federal government's
14
    justification or stated rationale that one of the reasons
15
    they rescinded DACA was a threat of future litigation.
16
    That litigation is happening right now. So if that
17
    litigation was to be stopped or even to be stayed in some
18
    way, that perhaps reduces some of that rationale.
19
                    So I think that the continuing existence
20
    of this case and a ruling from this Court would indeed
    help the Court, the Supreme Court, in deciding the issues
22
    in front of it.
23
                  THE COURT: Ms. Perales, do you want to
24
    weigh in?
25
                                 Thank you, Your Honor.
                  MS. PERALES:
               Johnny C. Sanchez, RMR, CRR - jcscourtreporter@aol.com
```

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I think to some extent, the pending motion from New Jersey interacts with our more recently filed motion for stay at Docket Entry 432. And the basis for our motion, which is actually a motion for leave to submit supplemental briefing is that we have had seven more months of discovery and development of the record since briefing closed on the plaintiff's motion for summary judgment. We have developed a great deal more evidence, including expert testimony, lay witness testimony, answers to interrogatories, production of documents. THE COURT: What issues would they go to? MS. PERALES: They go to both the issues standing, as well as the issue of how DACA is implemented, how it is carried out. And that's a very central issue with respect to the merits. Even putting aside the question of standing, which is very strongly joined in this later part of the discovery. THE COURT: Of course, the courts that have ruled on the recision cases, I mean, basically, they granted standing for anybody that had ever met a DACA recipient. I mean, their rulings on standing are incredibly broad. You don't have to comment on that. But what would show that the State would not have standing? And I just mean that hypothetically. You don't have to quote evidence to me. But

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

hypothetically, if a state says, "I'm coming in and representing my citizens, and I think my citizens are getting the short end of the stick here," what would I have to say that's not true? MS. PERALES: I think there would have to be some evidence that the citizens are getting the short end of the stick. And what we have developed through further development of the record, which was under the scheduling order that the Court set out for us, is a great deal more evidence touching on that, as well as how DACA's implemented. And I wanted to mention that we are still waiting for the last of the discovery to come from the federal government under the Court's order granting them an extension until October 14th. We have additional material. And the last time we were here with you, Your Honor, we spoke about a review of records of actual DACA recipients, and the federal government is concluding that sample. THE COURT: Let me ask -- Mr. Hu, you may not be the one that can really address this, but the government has filed pleadings that basically say this discovery doesn't matter one way or the other because it has to be decided on the record, the administrative record.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

```
Mr. Hu, do you feel qualified to join?
              MR. HU: We don't believe there should be
any further discovery at this time. I mean, after summary
judgment stage, the Court has indicated there might be a
need for discovery.
              THE COURT: Well, I'm considering the
fact -- and, I mean, we're just sitting here, we're on the
record obviously, but this is -- we're not arguing the
merits more than we're arguing procedure here. I mean,
I'm considering asking for briefing on that issue, on what
can I consider. Am I -- you know, because I think it's
been raised in some of these other cases, and I know --
I'm blank, Mr. Hu, on where it was raised by the
government. But they're basically saying the record was
the record when it got implemented, and that's all you can
consider.
              MR. HU:
                       That's correct. That's typically
how the APA review process works.
              THE COURT: And, you know, that was not
arqued in our prior case. And it wasn't arqued, really,
in the beginning of this case. At least I don't remember
it being argued. Because if I'd been convinced of that, I
wouldn't have let any discovery go on because it all would
have been moot and a waste of time.
                Now, I know the government, the state
```

Johnny C. Sanchez, RMR, CRR - jcscourtreporter@aol.com

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

government, the other government, their position has always been that no discovery was necessary, but I think your position was not -- and, Mr. Disher, you correct me -- but your position was not what the United States government's position is now, but if we're stuck on the APA record, your position we can just win as a matter of I mean, am I right about that? law. MR. DISHER: You are, Your Honor. The legal issues or, rather, the dispositive issues in this case are purely legal issues. Those issues have been teed up as early as the challenge to extend the DACA, and certainly re-teed up in this case when we filed in May of 2018, as well as when we filed our motion for summary judgment in February of this year. So those are legal issues which are in fact dispositive to this entire case are fully briefed up and they are fully in front of the Court and fully developed, to the extent that the Court needs any additional information. MS. PERALES: And, of course, it's our position, Your Honor, as defendant intervenors that, of course, much of this is driven by the evidence that we've developed since we filed our brief, and I believe briefing closed sometime around February, we've had seven more months of discovery.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

```
THE COURT: What would be the difference --
and, again, I'm not -- I'm thinking out loud here more
than I'm asking. I'm really asking for advice from all
four of you -- between me staying the case, and me ruling,
and staying the effect of the ruling?
                           I think that one of the biggest
              MR. DISHER:
differences would be if you rule, that will, in essence,
go to -- and have, perhaps, some effect on the 2017
recision cases before the Court, because if you ruled, for
example, hypothetically, that DACA is in fact unlawful, I
think that will lend credence to the stated justification
under the 2017 recision memo, that part of the reason the
government was rescinding DACA was a fear that DACA was
going to be ruled unlawful.
                Well, if that fear comes to fruition, then
that proves them right, which means that they're stated
justification can be anything but arbitrary and
capricious.
              THE COURT:
                          I guess my -- and I don't want
to steal the defendant's thunder here -- but if I was
going to answer that, I'd say, "Well, Judge, haven't you
already done that in your preliminary injunction hearing?"
I mean, you've said if you had to rule as a matter of law
on the likelihood of success on the merits, that Texas
would win.
```

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

```
Now, you know, but an injunction wasn't
granted because that's one of -- or two of the elements
they won were out of the other five, the other three they
lost, at least in my mind, in my ruling. So why -- I
mean, isn't that enough? I mean, isn't that enough to
signal to the supremes that, you know...
              MR. DISHER: Well, Your Honor, couple of
things on that point. I think, first of all, if this
Court was to rule on the summary judgment, even if it
stayed the effect of its ruling, I imagine that the
parties would still be allowed to pursue appellate
remedies at that point. So the case would still be in
existence and it would still be progressing through the
legal channels.
                So, again, the threat that the DOJ was
concerned about would still very much exist, as opposed if
this case was just definitely stayed, I think that that
lessens their argument. And, so, I think that a court --
                And then my second point would be that
this Court, of course, ruled on a preliminary injunctive
basis, and I think we all recognize that the practical
effect of a final judgment on the merits is different than
a ruling on the preliminary injunction.
              MS. SE CREST: Your Honor, it's our position
that if the Court were to rule now, it would be on a very
```

```
1
   partial and undeveloped record. At the time that the
 2
    plaintiffs filed their motion for summary judgment, we had
 3
    essentially the preliminary injunction record. We did not
 4
    have more.
 5
                    And what we have now is a soon-to-conclude
 6
    seven additional months of discovery that provide much
 7
   more of the record than what the Court had before. And we
 8
    would urge the Court to proceed in this case on this
 9
    case's sake, and not for the sake of any other case,
10
    including the cases pending before the Supreme Court,
11
    which will be submitted on November 12th during argument.
12
                  THE COURT: I understand that. I mean,
13
    clearly the motion to stay and it was filed was based on
14
    don't rule, please don't rule because the supremes may
15
    take care of this for you, which is not an unappealing
16
    argument for a judge.
17
                    Go ahead. Weigh in.
18
                  MR. MORAMARCO: Your Honor, yeah.
                                                     I'd like
19
    to weigh in on that. And I do think the way the Ninth
20
    Circuit -- and I do want to emphasize, the Ninth Circuit
21
    decision found that it was arbitrary and capricious, but
22
    because the government concluded that DACA was unlawful,
23
    that's the basis for their holding for -- and that's what
24
    the Supreme Court is going to be revealing.
25
                    So I do think there's a decent chance that
```

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

the Court will reach that issue. And I don't see the advantage. I've seen a lot of downsides to sort of the DACA population if this Court were to issue a ruling that puts more apprehension in their hearts about their future when I think we all believe that, ultimately, the Supreme Court is going to be the decisionmaker on this. It may take longer to get there if it goes through this Court, but the one part that I strenuously disagree with Texas about is that there's really a downside to waiting here, and I know this case has gone on for a long time. And Your Honor knows that as well a anyone. But that's a result, to a large extent, of Texas not bringing this case against DACA years ago in the DACA litigation. They made a strategic decision not to challenge DACA. So when we're close to the Supreme Court potentially resolving this issue, the downside risk of a court getting it wrong and sending, you know, or having these individuals live in fear again of what the future is going to hold, perhaps precipitously, is significant. And I do think, while this Court can weigh in on the issue and it might be an advantage, we're getting closer to an advisory opinion if there's not going to be any actual remedy associated with that. And I do think that was one of the arguments, obviously, we made that it's hard for this

```
1
    Court to really craft a remedy at this stage, given that
 2
    there are injunctions that are in existence that are
 3
   before the Supreme Court now if the Supreme Court is
    allowed to continue.
 4
 5
                    So there's no real practical relief that
 6
    this Court -- at least our position -- can give to the
 7
    State of Texas and sister states. But I do think that
 8
    there isn't a huge upside to weighing in if the Supreme
 9
    Court is ultimately going to decide this. And the status
10
    quo doesn't really hurt Texas, in our opinion.
11
                  THE COURT: Mr. Hu, you got a feeling?
12
                  MR. HU: We really take no position on, and
    we do leave it to the discretion of the Court as to
13
14
    whether to stay or not.
15
                  MR. DISHER: Your Honor, may I? I quess I
    want to shift focus a little bit because we filed this
16
17
    lawsuit as the plaintiff. Now, New Jersey, of course,
18
    came in as an intervenor and they argue that there's no --
19
    there's no upside to pursuing it. I think that that
20
    actually flips the analysis on its head. We need to look
21
    at what is the downside of continuing this case? I don't
22
    think that there is a downside.
23
                    The lion's share of the work has been
24
    done, discovery, the factor for discovery has closed, the
25
    DOJ is going to produce one additional piece of
```

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

```
information that they have agreed to, I think next week.
And, again, we've had over 400 pages of briefing in this
case, over 30 depositions, thousands of pages of
production. And, really, there is no benefit to setting
this case.
                There is, of course, a cost to us because
we've done all of this work, and now we are indefinitely
postponing based on a decision that may not help move the
ball forward in this case at all. But I really don't see
any benefit to staying this case, at this point, a year
and a half in, after we've all been traveling around the
country, doing depositions, expending the money that's
already been expended, to tee up to what are ultimately
legal issues that this Court is now ready to rule on.
              THE COURT: Now, New Jersey has you beat on
that argument, because their brief points out, "Yeah, our
work is done, but the court is just beginning." That's
very persuasive argument.
                All right. Here's what I'm going to do.
I'm not going to rule on the motion to stay, but I am
cancelling the October 28 hearing. But what I want on
October 28th, is for y'all to file a brief on what I can
consider. And I'm not ruling on your motion, Ms. Perales,
yet because it may be, you know, whether you want to file
additional stuff and want to do some additional things, if
```

I conclude, based on the briefing, that all I have is the 1 record about when it was enacted, then all of this 2 3 subsequent stuff is, you know, window dressing really. I mean, I know the federal government has taken that place, 4 5 that position, state's taken that position, albeit for a 6 different reason. But what I really want to say, really 7 want y'all to focus on is the APA, is what can I consider 8 in whether this was lawfully enacted within the APA, and 9 am I stuck with whatever APA record is. That's 10 number one. 11 And then number two, what do I have with 12 the APA? Do I have anything? I mean, because this 13 issue -- and maybe it was raised a lot earlier and I 14 didn't really focus on it. But it's clearly the 15 government in the last couple briefs that had to do with discovery, their position is, "Wait a minute. Time out. 16 17 All you get to consider is this. So why are we doing 18 discovery?" 19 So I would like y'all to each focus on 20 those two questions, number one, what can I consider; and, 21 number two, if all I can consider is the APA record, what 22 is the APA record, and what do I have of it, and where is 23 it in the file?" Because I'm not sure -- not that I -you know, I don't focus, you know, until it's time for me 24 25 to rule on everything that you've attached and all that

```
kind of stuff, but do I actually have any of the APA
 1
 2
    records?
 3
                    And, so, I will then reset the hearing,
   but probably before I reset the hearing, I'll take
 4
 5
   Ms. Perales' motion based on what you guys convince me I
    can look at. Will that delay things? Yes, it will. Will
 6
 7
    it delay it long enough for the Supreme Court to rule?
 8
    Probably not.
 9
                  MR. MORAMARCO: We may need some oral
10
    argument, Your Honor.
11
                  THE COURT: And I'm not saying I might not
12
    eventually grant your motion to stay, but I think in order
    to rule on Ms. Perales' current motion, it's incumbent on
13
14
    me to know what I can consider, because if all I can
15
    consider is the APA record, then why waste anymore time
16
    looking at discovery?
17
                    All right. Anything else we can resolve
18
    today?
19
                  MR. DISHER: Not from the state.
20
                  MR. MORAMARCO: Nothing here, Your Honor.
21
                  THE COURT: All right. Thank y'all.
22
                    Off the record.
23
             (An off-the-record discussion was held)
24
25
```

```
1
                     COURT REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE
 2
 3 I, Johnny C. Sanchez, certify that the foregoing is a
 4 correct transcript from the record of proceedings in the
 5 above-entitled matter.
 6
                                     /s/
Johnny C. Sanchez, CRR, RMR
 7
 8
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
                 Johnny C. Sanchez, RMR, CRR - jcscourtreporter@aol.com
```

	T	T
/s [1] - 23:6	basis [3] - 11:3, 16:21, 17:23	continue [1] - 19:4
11 [1] - 6:16	Batalla [1] - 7:11	continuing [2] - 10:19, 19:21
12 [1] - 9:15	beat [1] - 20:15	convince [1] - 22:5
12th [1] - 17:11	beginning [2] - 13:21, 20:17	convinced [1] - 13:22
14th [1] - 12:15	benefit [2] - 20:4, 20:10	correct [4] - 9:12, 13:17, 14:3, 23:4
2012 [2] - 9:8, 10:6	better [1] - 7:21	correctly [1] - 6:11
2017 [3] - 9:6, 15:8, 15:12	between [3] - 5:13, 7:4, 15:4	cost [1] - 20:6
2018 [1] - 14:12	biggest [1] - 15:6	country [1] - 20:12
28 [1] - 20:21	Biggs [1] - 3:7	couple [2] - 16:7, 21:15
28(j [1] - 8:1	BIGGS [1] - 3:9	course [7] - 9:9, 11:18, 14:20, 14:22,
28th [1] - 20:22	bit [1] - 19:16	16:20, 19:17, 20:6
30 [1] - 20:3	blank [1] - 13:13	court [7] - 5:8, 5:9, 8:15, 16:18, 18:17,
400 [1] - 20:2	brief [6] - 6:5, 6:15, 7:2, 14:23, 20:16,	20:17
432 [1] - 11:3	20:22	COURT [28] - 3:1, 3:11, 3:16, 3:20,
52 [1] - 7:2	briefed [5] - 5:16, 6:15, 7:1, 9:20,	3:23, 4:9, 4:15, 4:19, 5:7, 6:7, 6:10,
6 [1] - 7:17	14:16	7:18, 8:6, 9:10, 10:23, 11:11, 11:18,
8 [1] - 7:17	briefing [8] - 7:24, 8:3, 11:5, 11:7,	12:20, 13:6, 13:19, 15:1, 15:19, 17:12,
above-entitled [1] - 23:5	13:10, 14:23, 20:2, 21:1	19:11, 20:15, 22:11, 22:21, 23:1
actual [2] - 12:17, 18:22	briefs [2] - 6:3, 21:15	Court [55] - 4:6, 4:23, 5:2, 5:14, 5:16,
Adam [1] - 3:7	bringing [1] - 18:12	5:20, 6:17, 6:19, 6:21, 6:23, 7:1, 7:3,
addition [1] - 3:14	broad [1] - 11:22	7:6, 7:14, 7:19, 7:25, 8:2, 8:3, 8:24, 9:6, 9:16, 9:17, 9:25, 10:1, 10:11, 10:20,
additional [6] - 12:15, 14:19, 17:6,	business [1] - 4:20	10:21, 12:9, 13:4, 14:17, 14:18, 15:9,
19:25, 20:25	cancelling [1] - 20:21	16:9, 16:20, 16:25, 17:7, 17:8, 17:10,
address [1] - 12:21	capricious [2] - 15:18, 17:21	17:24, 18:1, 18:3, 18:6, 18:7, 18:15,
addresses [1] - 9:7	care [1] - 17:15	18:20, 19:1, 19:3, 19:6, 19:9, 19:13,
administrative [1] - 12:24	carried [1] - 11:14 case [30] - 5:15, 5:21, 5:25, 7:17, 8:12,	20:14, 22:7
advantage [2] - 18:2, 18:21	9:8, 9:14, 10:2, 10:7, 10:8, 10:9, 10:20,	Court's [1] - 12:14
advice [1] - 15:3	13:20, 13:21, 14:9, 14:12, 14:16, 15:4,	courts [3] - 8:13, 9:10, 11:18
advisory [1] - 18:22 afternoon [3] - 3:9, 3:10, 3:13	16:12, 16:17, 17:8, 17:9, 18:10, 18:12,	craft [1] - 19:1
ago [2] - 6:22, 18:13	19:21, 20:3, 20:5, 20:9, 20:10	credence [1] - 15:11
agreed [2] - 4:3, 20:1	case's [1] - 17:9	CREST [1] - 16:24
ahead [2] - 7:22, 17:17	cases [5] - 9:6, 11:19, 13:12, 15:9,	CRR [1] - 23:7
al [2] - 3:2, 3:3	17:10	current [1] - 22:13
Alabama [1] - 4:4	central [1] - 11:14	DACA [24] - 5:24, 6:2, 6:5, 6:12, 6:16,
albeit [1] - 21:5	cert [1] - 9:11	7:4, 7:5, 8:14, 8:20, 8:21, 10:4, 10:15,
allowed [2] - 16:11, 19:4	certainly [3] - 6:14, 10:13, 14:11	11:13, 11:20, 12:17, 14:11, 15:10,
almost [1] - 8:18	CERTIFICATE[1] - 23:1	15:13, 17:22, 18:3, 18:13, 18:14
analysis [1] - 19:20	certified [2] - 6:24, 7:6	DACA's [2] - 6:8, 12:10
answer [2] - 8:24, 15:21	certify [1] - 23:3	deal [2] - 11:8, 12:9
answers [1] - 11:9	chair [1] - 9:2	decent [1] - 17:25
APA [11] - 5:19, 13:18, 14:6, 21:7,	challenge [2] - 14:11, 18:14	decide [3] - 5:22, 7:22, 19:9
21:8, 21:9, 21:12, 21:21, 21:22, 22:1,	chance [2] - 7:16, 17:25	decided [1] - 12:24
22:15	channels [1] - 16:14	deciding [2] - 6:20, 10:21
appellate [1] - 16:11	Circuit [4] - 6:24, 8:19, 17:20	decision [3] - 17:21, 18:14, 20:8 decisionmaker [1] - 18:6
apprehension [1] - 18:4	citizens [3] - 12:2, 12:6	defendant [2] - 3:12, 14:21
arbitrary [2] - 15:17, 17:21	clearly [3] - 6:17, 17:13, 21:14	defendant's [1] - 15:20
argue [2] - 7:3, 19:18	close [1] - 18:15	definitely [1] - 16:17
argued [3] - 13:20, 13:22	closed [4] - 9:19, 11:7, 14:24, 19:24	delay [2] - 22:6, 22:7
argues [1] - 6:2	closer [1] - 18:21	denied [1] - 8:22
arguing [2] - 13:8, 13:9	comfortable [1] - 9:2 coming [1] - 12:1	deny [2] - 4:15, 4:16
argument [9] - 6:5, 6:16, 10:10, 16:18,	comment [1] - 12:1	depositions [2] - 20:3, 20:12
17:11, 17:16, 20:16, 20:18, 22:10	compel [2] - 3:24, 4:14	developed [4] - 11:8, 12:7, 14:18,
arguments [1] - 18:25 Arkansas [1] - 4:5	competing [1] - 6:3	14:23
aside [1] - 11:15	concerned [1] - 16:16	development [2] - 11:6, 12:8
aside [1] - 11.15 assistance [1] - 6:21	conclude [2] - 17:5, 21:1	DHS [1] - 6:11
associated [1] - 18:23	concluded [2] - 6:11, 17:22	differ [1] - 7:12
attached [1] - 21:25	concluding [1] - 12:18	difference [2] - 7:7, 15:1
ball [1] - 20:9	consider [9] - 13:11, 13:16, 20:23,	differences [1] - 15:7
based [6] - 4:7, 8:18, 17:13, 20:8, 21:1,	21:7, 21:17, 21:20, 21:21, 22:14, 22:15	different [2] - 16:22, 21:6
22:5	considering (2) - 13:6, 13:10	diminishes [1] - 10:10
Johnny C. Sanchez, RMR, CRR - jcscourtreporter@aol.com		

```
few [1] - 9:4
                                                                                                hurt [1] - 19:10
 directly [1] - 6:18
 disagree [1] - 18:8
                                                Fifth [2] - 6:24, 8:19
                                                                                                hypothetically [3] - 11:24, 12:1, 15:10
 discovery [16] - 9:19, 11:6, 11:17,
                                                file [5] - 4:16, 8:1, 20:22, 20:24, 21:23
                                                                                                illegal [1] - 8:16
12:13, 12:23, 13:3, 13:5, 13:23, 14:2,
                                                                                                imagine [1] - 16:10
                                                filed [9] - 6:16, 11:2, 12:22, 14:12,
14:25, 17:6, 19:24, 21:16, 21:18, 22:16
                                               14:13, 14:23, 17:2, 17:13, 19:16
                                                                                                imminent [1] - 9:20
 discretion [2] - 7:9, 19:13
                                                final [1] - 16:22
                                                                                                implemented [3] - 11:13, 12:11, 13:15
 discussion [1] - 22:23
                                                fine [2] - 3:22, 5:10
                                                                                                including [2] - 11:9, 17:10
 Disher [5] - 3:4, 3:6, 8:7, 8:25, 14:3
                                                first [3] - 5:18, 9:2, 16:8
                                                                                                incredibly [1] - 11:22
 DISHER [9] - 3:6, 4:2, 9:3, 9:12, 14:8,
                                                five [3] - 6:4, 8:14, 16:3
                                                                                                incumbent [1] - 22:13
15:6, 16:7, 19:15, 22:19
                                                                                                indeed [2] - 4:5, 10:20
                                                flips [1] - 19:20
 dispositive [2] - 14:9, 14:16
                                                                                                indefinitely [1] - 20:7
                                                focus [5] - 19:16, 21:7, 21:14, 21:19,
 dispute [1] - 10:2
                                               21.24
                                                                                                indicated [1] - 13:4
 distinction [1] - 7:4
                                                follow [1] - 8:20
                                                                                                individuals [1] - 18:18
 Docket [1] - 11:3
                                                foregoing [1] - 23:3
                                                                                                inform [1] - 8:2
 documents [4] - 3:25, 4:4, 4:6, 11:10
                                                forward [1] - 20:9
                                                                                                information [2] - 14:19, 20:1
 dodge [1] - 8:17
                                                four [2] - 8:14, 15:4
                                                                                                initial [2] - 5:23, 5:24
 DOJ [2] - 16:15, 19:25
                                                frankly [1] - 4:22
                                                                                                injunction [6] - 6:23, 8:22, 15:22, 16:1,
 done [7] - 7:25, 8:4, 9:17, 15:22,
                                                front [2] - 10:22, 14:17
                                                                                              16:23, 17:3
19:24, 20:7, 20:17
                                                fruition [1] - 15:15
                                                                                                injunctions [1] - 19:2
 down [3] - 9:1, 9:23, 10:4
                                                fully [5] - 9:19, 9:21, 14:16, 14:17
                                                                                                injunctive [1] - 16:20
 downside [4] - 18:9, 18:16, 19:21,
                                                future [4] - 10:5, 10:15, 18:4, 18:18
                                                                                                interacts [1] - 11:2
                                                gain [1] - 9:23
                                                                                                interrogatories [1] - 11:10
 downsides [1] - 18:2
                                                given [3] - 7:23, 8:20, 19:1
                                                                                                intervenor [1] - 19:18
 dressing [1] - 21:3
                                                Glenn [1] - 3:18
                                                                                                intervenors [2] - 3:12, 14:21
 driven [1] - 14:22
                                                government [15] - 5:20, 6:1, 6:4, 7:16,
                                                                                                issue [16] - 6:3, 6:12, 6:17, 6:20, 7:8,
 during [1] - 17:11
                                               12:14, 12:18, 12:22, 13:14, 13:25, 14:1,
                                                                                              7:22, 8:17, 10:1, 11:13, 11:14, 13:10,
 early [1] - 14:11
                                               15:13, 17:22, 21:4, 21:15
                                                                                              18:1, 18:3, 18:16, 18:20, 21:13
 easier [1] - 5:8
                                                government's [4] - 7:2, 10:3, 10:13,
                                                                                                issued [1] - 6:23
                                               14:5
 easy [1] - 3:24
                                                                                                issues [17] - 5:13, 5:14, 5:17, 6:14,
 effect [4] - 15:5, 15:8, 16:10, 16:22
                                                grant [3] - 5:24, 8:9, 22:12
                                                                                              6:25, 7:6, 7:13, 10:21, 11:11, 11:12,
 eight [2] - 8:10, 9:15
                                                granted [4] - 9:11, 9:14, 11:20, 16:2
                                                                                              14:9, 14:10, 14:15, 20:14
 elements [1] - 16:2
                                                granting [1] - 12:14
                                                                                                Jersey [4] - 3:17, 11:2, 19:17, 20:15
 emphasize [1] - 17:20
                                                great [4] - 3:17, 4:20, 11:8, 12:9
                                                                                                Jersey's [1] - 4:20
                                                quess [7] - 4:25, 7:17, 8:1, 8:4, 8:6,
 enacted [2] - 21:2, 21:8
                                                                                                iob [1] - 4:24
 end [3] - 6:19, 12:3, 12:6
                                               15:19, 19:15
                                                                                                Johnny [2] - 23:3, 23:7
                                                                                                join [1] - 13:1
 entire [1] - 14:16
                                                guidance [1] - 6:25
 entirely [1] - 8:19
                                                guys [1] - 22:5
                                                                                                joined [3] - 6:3, 6:13, 11:16
                                                half [2] - 9:18, 20:11
 entitled [1] - 23:5
                                                                                                Judge [1] - 15:21
                                                hand [1] - 4:20
                                                                                                judge [1] - 17:16
 Entry [1] - 11:3
 essence [1] - 15:7
                                                happy [1] - 4:14
                                                                                                judgment [8] - 9:21, 10:12, 11:8, 13:4,
 essentially [3] - 4:3, 5:21, 17:3
                                                hard [1] - 18:25
                                                                                               14:13, 16:9, 16:22, 17:2
                                                head [1] - 19:20
                                                                                                judicially [1] - 5:19
 et [2] - 3:2, 3:3
                                                                                                justification [3] - 10:14, 15:11, 15:17
 eventually [1] - 22:12
                                                hear [1] - 5:8
 evidence [5] - 11:8, 11:25, 12:6, 12:10,
                                                hearing [5] - 5:9, 15:22, 20:21, 22:3,
                                                                                                kicking [1] - 9:22
                                                                                                kind [1] - 22:1
                                                heart [1] - 9:8
                                                                                                know.. [1] - 16:6
 example [1] - 15:10
                                                hearts [1] - 18:4
 exist [1] - 16:16
                                                                                                knows [1] - 18:11
                                                held [2] - 8:15, 22:23
 existence [3] - 10:19, 16:13, 19:2
                                                                                                lack [1] - 7:21
 exists [1] - 10:8
                                                help [5] - 5:4, 7:21, 9:25, 10:21, 20:8
                                                                                                large [1] - 18:12
 expended [1] - 20:13
                                                helps [3] - 5:3, 8:11, 9:17
                                                                                                last [5] - 4:2, 4:5, 12:13, 12:16, 21:15
                                                hold [1] - 18:19
 expending [1] - 20:12
                                                                                                law [2] - 14:7, 15:23
 expert [1] - 11:9
                                                holding [1] - 17:23
                                                                                                lawful [4] - 6:2, 6:5, 6:9, 6:16
 extend [1] - 14:11
                                                Honor [21] - 3:6, 3:9, 3:10, 3:13, 3:18,
                                                                                                lawfully [1] - 21:8
                                               4:2, 4:11, 5:5, 5:11, 9:3, 10:25, 12:17,
                                                                                                lawfulness [2] - 7:4, 7:5
 extension [1] - 12:15
                                               14:8, 14:21, 16:7, 16:24, 17:18, 18:11,
 extent [3] - 11:1, 14:18, 18:12
                                                                                                lawsuit [1] - 19:17
                                               19:15, 22:10, 22:20
 fact [6] - 6:5, 7:1, 10:8, 13:7, 14:16,
                                                                                                lay [1] - 11:9
                                                Honor's [1] - 9:13
15:10
                                                                                                least [3] - 13:21, 16:4, 19:6
 factor [1] - 19:24
                                                hotly [1] - 10:2
                                                                                                leave [2] - 11:4, 19:13
                                                hu [2] - 12:20, 19:11
 fairly [1] - 6:2
                                                                                                left [1] - 5:22
 fear [3] - 15:13, 15:15, 18:18
                                                Hu [3] - 3:20, 13:1, 13:13
                                                                                                legal [5] - 14:8, 14:10, 14:15, 16:14,
                                                HU [4] - 3:22, 13:2, 13:17, 19:12
 February [2] - 14:14, 14:24
                                                                                              20:14
 federal [4] - 10:13, 12:14, 12:18, 21:4
                                                huge [1] - 19:8
                                                                                                legality [3] - 8:18, 9:7, 10:6
                                            Sanchez, RMR, CRR - jcscourtreporter@aol.com
                              Johnny C.
```

```
lend [1] - 15:11
                                                                                               preliminary [5] - 6:23, 15:22, 16:20,
                                                November [1] - 17:11
 lessens [1] - 16:18
                                                                                              16:23, 17:3
                                                number [5] - 8:22, 21:10, 21:11, 21:20,
                                                                                               presumably [1] - 5:21
 letter [1] - 8:2
                                                obvious [1] - 8:9
                                                                                               problematic [1] - 7:9
 likelihood [1] - 15:24
                                                obviously [5] - 7:19, 8:4, 8:23, 13:8,
 lion's [1] - 19:23
                                                                                               procedure [1] - 13:9
 litigation [6] - 9:18, 10:5, 10:15, 10:16,
                                                                                               proceed [1] - 17:8
10:17, 18:13
                                                occurred [1] - 9:19
                                                                                               proceedings [1] - 23:4
 live [1] - 18:18
                                                October [3] - 12:15, 20:21, 20:22
                                                                                               process [1] - 13:18
 look [4] - 5:15, 19:20, 22:6
                                                off-the-record [1] - 22:23
                                                                                               produce [5] - 4:4, 4:6, 4:8, 4:13, 19:25
                                                Olson [1] - 6:15
 looking [3] - 6:6, 6:24, 22:16
                                                                                               produced [1] - 3:25
                                                once [1] - 9:7
 lost [1] - 16:4
                                                                                               production [2] - 11:10, 20:4
                                                one [19] - 3:24, 5:18, 6:13, 6:14, 6:17,
 loud [1] - 15:2
                                                                                               program [1] - 7:10
                                              7:5, 8:4, 10:4, 10:12, 10:14, 12:21,
 love [1] - 8:23
                                                                                               progressing [1] - 16:13
                                               12:23, 15:6, 16:2, 18:8, 18:24, 19:25,
 magic [1] - 4:22
                                                                                               proves [2] - 10:8, 15:16
 Maramarco [1] - 3:19
                                              21:10, 21:20
                                                                                               provide [1] - 17:6
 material [1] - 12:16
                                                ones [1] - 8:13
                                                                                               pulling [1] - 10:4
 matter [4] - 12:23, 14:6, 15:23, 23:5
                                                opening [1] - 6:4
                                                                                               purely [1] - 14:10
                                                opinion [7] - 7:7, 8:19, 8:20, 9:11,
 mean [20] - 4:11, 4:21, 6:22, 7:19,
                                                                                               pursue [1] - 16:11
                                               9:16, 18:22, 19:10
7:22, 8:17, 11:19, 11:21, 11:24, 13:3,
                                                                                               pursuing [1] - 19:19
                                                opposed [2] - 8:8, 16:16
13:7, 13:9, 14:7, 15:23, 16:5, 17:12,
                                                                                               puts [1] - 18:4
                                                oral [1] - 22:9
21:4, 21:12
                                                                                               putting [1] - 11:15
                                                order [4] - 8:18, 12:9, 12:14, 22:12
 meaningful [1] - 7:4
                                                                                               qualified [1] - 13:1
                                                original [1] - 7:5
 means [1] - 15:16
                                                                                               questions [4] - 6:24, 8:5, 9:4, 21:20
                                                ought [1] - 4:25
 memo [3] - 9:8, 10:6, 15:12
                                                                                               quit [1] - 4:24
                                                overlap [1] - 5:13
                                                                                               quite [1] - 4:22
 mention [1] - 12:12
 merits [5] - 7:20, 11:15, 13:9, 15:24,
                                                Page [1] - 7:2
                                                                                               quo [1] - 19:10
                                                pages [4] - 6:4, 6:16, 20:2, 20:3
16:22
                                                                                               quote [1] - 11:25
                                                part [4] - 8:18, 11:17, 15:12, 18:8
 met [1] - 11:20
                                                                                               raised [4] - 5:17, 13:12, 13:13, 21:13
 might [4] - 5:21, 13:4, 18:21, 22:11
                                                partial [1] - 17:1
                                                                                               Ramon [1] - 3:14
                                                parties [3] - 6:13, 10:2, 16:11
 mind [1] - 16:4
                                                                                               rather [1] - 14:9
 minds [1] - 7:11
                                                pending [3] - 10:11, 11:1, 17:10
                                                                                               rationale [2] - 10:14, 10:18
 minute [3] - 4:21, 5:4, 21:16
                                                Perales [4] - 3:11, 3:14, 10:23, 20:23
                                                                                               rationales [1] - 10:2
 money [2] - 4:25, 20:12
                                                PERALES [7] - 3:13, 4:11, 4:18, 10:25,
                                                                                               re [1] - 14:12
 months [6] - 7:17, 8:10, 9:15, 11:6,
                                               11:12, 12:5, 14:20
                                                                                               re-teed [1] - 14:12
14:25, 17:6
                                                Perales' [2] - 22:5, 22:13
                                                                                               reach [4] - 6:18, 7:15, 18:1
                                                percolating [1] - 7:14
 moot [4] - 4:9, 4:16, 4:17, 13:24
                                                                                               react [1] - 8:1
 MORAMARCO[9] - 3:18, 5:5, 5:11,
                                                perhaps [4] - 10:10, 10:18, 15:8, 18:19
                                                                                               ready [1] - 20:14
6:8, 6:11, 7:24, 17:18, 22:9, 22:20
                                                Peroyea [1] - 3:8
                                                                                               real [3] - 4:19, 4:25, 19:5
                                                PEROYEA [1] - 3:10
 Moramarco [1] - 5:1
                                                                                               Really [1] - 6:7
                                                persuasive [1] - 20:18
 motion [21] - 3:24, 4:9, 4:14, 4:21, 5:1,
                                                                                               really [15] - 5:18, 9:16, 12:21, 13:20,
8:9, 9:20, 10:11, 11:1, 11:3, 11:4, 11:7,
                                                piece [1] - 19:25
                                                                                              15:3, 18:9, 19:1, 19:10, 19:12, 20:4,
14:13, 17:2, 17:13, 20:20, 20:23, 22:5,
                                                place [1] - 21:4
                                                                                              20:9, 21:3, 21:6, 21:14
22:12, 22:13
                                                plaintiff [1] - 19:17
                                                                                               reason [3] - 5:25, 15:12, 21:6
 motions [1] - 9:19
                                                plaintiff's [1] - 11:7
                                                                                               reasonable [2] - 7:7, 7:11
 move [1] - 20:8
                                                plaintiffs [2] - 4:13, 17:2
                                                                                               reasons [3] - 8:23, 10:4, 10:14
 MR [24] - 3:6, 3:9, 3:10, 3:18, 3:22, 4:2,
                                                pleadings [1] - 12:22
                                                                                               receive [1] - 4:12
5:5, 5:11, 6:8, 6:11, 7:24, 9:3, 9:12,
                                                point [7] - 9:13, 9:17, 9:24, 16:8,
                                                                                               recently [1] - 11:2
13:2, 13:17, 14:8, 15:6, 16:7, 17:18,
                                               16:12, 16:19, 20:10
                                                                                               recipient [1] - 11:21
19:12, 19:15, 22:9, 22:19, 22:20
                                                points [2] - 9:4, 20:16
                                                                                               recipients [1] - 12:18
 MS [8] - 3:13, 4:11, 4:18, 10:25, 11:12,
                                                policy [1] - 7:5
                                                                                               recision [10] - 5:19, 5:22, 5:23, 6:9,
12:5, 14:20, 16:24
                                                population [1] - 18:3
                                                                                              8:14, 9:6, 10:3, 11:19, 15:9, 15:12
 necessary [1] - 14:2
                                                position [15] - 4:12, 5:12, 10:3, 14:1,
                                                                                               recognize [1] - 16:21
 need [3] - 13:5, 19:20, 22:9
                                               14:3, 14:4, 14:5, 14:6, 14:21, 16:24,
                                                                                               record [19] - 11:6, 12:8, 12:24, 12:25,
 needs [1] - 14:18
                                               19:6, 19:12, 21:5, 21:16
                                                                                              13:8, 13:14, 13:15, 14:6, 17:1, 17:3,
 never [1] - 9:7
                                                possibility [1] - 9:14
                                                                                              17:7, 21:2, 21:9, 21:21, 21:22, 22:15,
 New [5] - 3:17, 4:20, 11:2, 19:17, 20:15
                                                postponing [1] - 20:8
                                                                                             22:22, 22:23, 23:4
 next [1] - 20:1
                                                potential [2] - 6:24, 7:16
                                                                                               records [2] - 12:17, 22:2
 Nina [1] - 3:14
                                                potentially [1] - 18:16
                                                                                               reduces [1] - 10:18
 nine [1] - 9:15
                                                practical [2] - 16:21, 19:5
                                                                                               Regions [1] - 7:10
 Ninth [2] - 17:19, 17:20
                                                precipitously [1] - 18:19
                                                                                               relevant [1] - 5:24
 noted [1] - 7:10
                                                predict [1] - 4:23
                                                                                               relief [1] - 19:5
 nothing [4] - 4:7, 4:13, 8:10, 22:20
                                                prefer [1] - 5:6
                                                                                               remedies [1] - 16:12
                             Johnny C. Sanchez, RMR, CRR - jcscourtreporter@aol.com
```

```
remedy [2] - 18:23, 19:1
                                                Soto [1] - 3:15
                                                                                                touching [1] - 12:10
 remember [2] - 8:13, 13:21
                                                spent [2] - 6:4, 6:16
                                                                                                towards [1] - 10:13
 report [1] - 4:6
                                                stage [2] - 13:4, 19:1
                                                                                                transcript [1] - 23:4
 reporter [3] - 5:8, 5:9
                                                standing [5] - 11:13, 11:16, 11:20,
                                                                                                traveling [1] - 20:11
 REPORTER'S [1] - 23:1
                                               11:21, 11:24
                                                                                                Trent [1] - 3:7
 representing [2] - 3:17, 12:2
                                                start [2] - 3:23, 5:1
                                                                                                true [2] - 8:16, 12:4
 requests [1] - 4:8
                                                state [4] - 10:2, 12:1, 13:25, 22:19
                                                                                                Tuesday [2] - 4:2, 4:5
                                                State [7] - 3:2, 3:4, 3:7, 3:17, 4:20,
 rescinded [1] - 10:15
                                                                                                two [5] - 5:17, 16:2, 21:11, 21:20,
 rescinding [1] - 15:13
                                               11:23, 19:7
                                                                                              21.21
                                                state's [1] - 21:5
 reset [2] - 22:3, 22:4
                                                                                               typically [1] - 13:17
                                                states [1] - 19:7
 resolve [2] - 8:11, 22:17
                                                                                                U.S.A [1] - 3:3
                                                States [2] - 5:16, 14:4
                                                                                                ultimately [3] - 18:5, 19:9, 20:13
 resolved [1] - 3:25
 resolving [1] - 18:16
                                                status [1] - 19:9
                                                                                                unappealing [1] - 17:15
                                                stay [8] - 4:21, 9:1, 9:14, 11:3, 17:13,
                                                                                                under [5] - 5:19, 5:24, 12:8, 12:14,
 respect [1] - 11:15
                                               19:14, 20:20, 22:12
                                                                                              15:12
 response [1] - 9:4
                                                stayed [4] - 10:9, 10:17, 16:10, 16:17
                                                                                                underlying [1] - 9:8
 responsive [2] - 4:4, 4:8
 result [1] - 18:12
                                                staying [3] - 15:4, 15:5, 20:10
                                                                                                undeveloped [1] - 17:1
                                                steal [1] - 15:20
                                                                                                United [2] - 5:16, 14:4
 revealing [1] - 17:24
                                                stick [2] - 12:3, 12:7
                                                                                                unlawful [4] - 6:12, 15:10, 15:14,
 review [2] - 12:17, 13:18
                                                still [6] - 9:15, 12:12, 16:11, 16:12,
 reviewable [1] - 5:19
                                               16:13, 16:16
 risk [1] - 18:16
                                                                                                up [9] - 5:7, 6:19, 7:21, 9:21, 9:25,
 RMR [1] - 23:7
                                                stopped [1] - 10:17
                                                                                              14:10, 14:12, 14:16, 20:13
 road [1] - 9:23
                                                strategic [1] - 18:14
                                                                                                upside [2] - 19:8, 19:19
 rule [16] - 5:3, 5:20, 7:19, 8:11, 10:11,
                                                strenuously [2] - 6:2, 18:8
                                                                                                urge [1] - 17:8
                                                strongly [1] - 11:16
                                                                                                valid [2] - 5:23, 7:10
15:7, 15:23, 16:9, 16:25, 17:14, 20:14,
                                                stuck [2] - 14:5, 21:9
                                                                                                Vegas [1] - 4:24
20:20, 21:25, 22:7, 22:13
ruled [5] - 8:14, 11:19, 15:9, 15:14,
                                                stuff [3] - 20:25, 21:3, 22:1
                                                                                                versus [1] - 3:2
                                                submit [1] - 11:4
                                                                                                Vidal [1] - 7:10
16:20
                                                submitted [1] - 17:11
                                                                                                Wait [1] - 21:16
rules [1] - 9:6
ruling [10] - 6:23, 7:20, 10:20, 15:4,
                                                subsequent [1] - 21:3
                                                                                                wait [1] - 8:10
15:5, 16:4, 16:10, 16:23, 18:3, 20:23
                                                substantial [1] - 5:12
                                                                                                waiting [2] - 12:13, 18:9
rulings [1] - 11:21
                                                success [1] - 15:24
                                                                                                waste [2] - 13:24, 22:15
 sake [2] - 17:9
                                                sufficient [1] - 7:9
                                                                                                ways [1] - 6:19
 sample [1] - 12:19
                                                summary [7] - 9:21, 10:11, 11:7, 13:3,
                                                                                                week [2] - 4:3. 20:1
 Sanchez [2] - 23:3, 23:7
                                               14:13, 16:9, 17:2
                                                                                                weigh [6] - 8:7, 8:25, 10:24, 17:17,
                                                                                              17:19, 18:20
 scenario [1] - 9:5
                                                supplemental [1] - 11:5
                                                Supreme [22] - 4:23, 5:2, 5:13, 5:16,
 scheduling [1] - 12:8
                                                                                                weighing [1] - 19:8
                                               7:1, 7:3, 7:14, 7:25, 8:3, 8:24, 9:6, 9:16,
 SE [1] - 16:24
                                                                                                win [2] - 14:6, 15:25
                                               10:1, 10:21, 17:10, 17:24, 18:5, 18:15,
 search [1] - 4:7
                                                                                                window [1] - 21:3
                                               19:3, 19:8, 22:7
 seated [1] - 3:1
                                                                                                wins [1] - 7:16
                                                supremes [3] - 7:22, 16:6, 17:14
 second [2] - 6:1, 16:19
                                                                                                withdraw [1] - 4:14
                                                table [1] - 3:20
                                                                                                witness [1] - 11:9
 see [2] - 18:1, 20:9
                                                technically [1] - 8:16
 selfish [1] - 5:3
                                                                                                won [1] - 16:3
 sending [1] - 18:17
                                                Ted [1] - 6:15
                                                                                                works [1] - 13:18
                                                tee [3] - 7:21, 9:25, 20:13
                                                                                                worried [1] - 10:5
 set [1] - 12:9
                                                teed [3] - 9:21, 14:10, 14:12
                                                                                                worry [4] - 8:7, 8:9, 8:10, 8:12
 setting [2] - 9:20, 20:4
                                                term [1] - 7:21
 seven [3] - 11:5, 14:24, 17:6
                                                                                                worth [1] - 9:18
                                                testimony [2] - 11:9
 share [1] - 19:23
                                                                                                y'all [4] - 20:22, 21:7, 21:19, 22:21
                                                Texas [7] - 3:2, 5:25, 15:24, 18:8,
                                                                                                year [4] - 6:22, 9:18, 14:14, 20:10
 shift [1] - 19:16
                                               18:12, 19:7, 19:10
 short [3] - 7:20, 12:3, 12:6
                                                                                                years [1] - 18:13
                                                THE [27] - 3:1, 3:11, 3:16, 3:20, 3:23,
 show [1] - 11:23
                                               4:9, 4:15, 4:19, 5:7, 6:7, 6:10, 7:18, 8:6,
 side [1] - 3:21
                                               9:10, 10:23, 11:11, 11:18, 12:20, 13:6,
 signal [1] - 16:6
                                               13:19, 15:1, 15:19, 17:12, 19:11, 20:15,
 significant [1] - 18:19
                                               22:11, 22:21
 sister [1] - 19:7
                                                thinking [1] - 15:2
 sit [2] - 9:1, 9:2
                                                thousands [1] - 20:3
 sitting [1] - 13:7
                                                threat [2] - 10:15, 16:15
 sometime [1] - 14:24
                                                three [1] - 16:3
 soon [1] - 17:5
                                                thunder [1] - 15:20
 soon-to-conclude [1] - 17:5
                                                today [1] - 22:18
 sorry [1] - 6:8
                                                Todd [1] - 3:6
 sort [3] - 8:1, 8:2, 18:2
                             Johnny C. Sanchez, RMR, CRR - jcscourtreporter@aol.com
```